

Notes on being a reviewer

George Starkschall, PhD
Editor-in-Chief, JACMP



General comments

- Consider the invitation to review an honor.
- Be willing to spend some time on the review.
- Respond promptly to the request to review.

General comments

- When you commit to the review, you are committing to see the review through to its completion.
- Review the manuscript in a timely manner.
- Do not be intimidated by the author.
- Respect confidentiality.

Doing the review - General

- Do an initial read of the manuscript.
 - Is the writing in clear English
- Consider the target audience.
 - Knowledgeable medical physicist, not necessarily the expert

Doing the review - General

- Does each part of the paper actually accomplish what it is intended to do?
 - Abstract
 - Introduction
 - Methods & Materials
 - Results
 - Discussion
 - Conclusions

Doing the review - Specific

- Go through the manuscript again with the fine-toothed comb.
- Be thorough with your review.
 - No need to raise additional points on second round review
- Identify each location where you recommend a change.

Doing the review - Specific

- Do not go into details of grammar unless the violations interfere with the actual information presented

In conclusion

- Be civil in your review.
- Make specific recommendation regarding the manuscript
 - Accept as is
 - Accept with minor revisions
 - Accept with major revisions
 - Reject


