Notes on being a reviewer

George Starkschall, PhD
Editor-in-Chief, JACMP

General comments

• Consider the invitation to review an honor.
• Be willing to spend some time on the review.
• Respond promptly to the request to review.

• When you commit to the review, you are committing to see the review through to its completion.
• Review the manuscript in a timely manner.
• Do not be intimidated by the author.
• Respect confidentiality.
Doing the review - General

• Do an initial read of the manuscript.
  – Is the writing in clear English
• Consider the target audience.
  – Knowledgeable medical physicist, not necessarily the expert

Doing the review - General

• Does each part of the paper actually accomplish what it is intended to do?
  – Abstract
  – Introduction
  – Methods & Materials
  – Results
  – Discussion
  – Conclusions

Doing the review - Specific

• Go through the manuscript again with the fine-toothed comb.
• Be thorough with your review.
  – No need to raise additional points on second round review
• Identify each location where you recommend a change.
Doing the review - Specific

• Do not go into details of grammar unless the violations interfere with the actual information presented

In conclusion

• Be civil in your review.
• Make specific recommendation regarding the manuscript
  – Accept as is
  – Accept with minor revisions
  – Accept with major revisions
  – Reject

Thank you